THE APPRAISAL OF EXECUTIVE PERFORMANCE*

1. General


Shows that appraisal programs fail to live up to expected results because of emphasis given to personality traits in the appraisal and the following interview. Both appraisal and interview should be based on job performance. Good job descriptions, performance standards, and position requirements which are job centered should be developed. "Thus industrial people will be working in an area they know something about rather than lost in the field of psychology."


The author uses AMA resources and his own experience to describe principles and techniques used in executive appraisal. He explains how to conduct planned appraisal interviews during which the subordinate executive reviews his performance and is encouraged to develop his abilities. The appraisal and communication process are shown to be continuing responsibilities. Constant observation and frequent talks should supplement yearly formal appraisals. The importance of environmental factors in appraising executives is also stressed.


Raises and attempts to answer two questions: "Are good coaches born, rather than made? Is it a waste of time and money . . . to try to train managers to conduct appraisal interviews at all?" Due to the need for

---

*Compiled by Louis Simpson, Assistant in Research. Supplements Selected References No. 71, September, 1956.

**Items from this list should be ordered directly from the publisher. Addresses are given in connection with each reference.
reality of experience, the author suggests that companies set up a workshop program in which the manager be given a chance to practice interviewing, to hear himself on tape, and to learn how others react to what he does.


Examines the historical evolution of formal management appraisal and identifies the various objectives, strengths, and weaknesses inherent in the traditional approach. The author concludes that an individual's optimum performance involves both factors within his control and factors largely within the control of management. For this reason, he suggests that there be a constant review of organization structure and of job classification and evaluation.


Examines the conventional performance appraisal plan which requires the manager to pass judgment on the personal worth of subordinates and finds that most executives not only lack skill to conduct such an interview, but they have a dislike of judging a subordinate. The author outlines a new approach in which greater objectivity is possible by placing the major responsibility on the subordinate for establishing short-term targets and appraising progress toward them. This plan avoids weaknesses of the old plan and benefits the organization by stimulating the development of the subordinates.


Reports findings of the Management Development Laboratory of the University of Minnesota Industrial Relations Center on current company practices in appraising managers. "The findings throw some interesting light on two specific questions: (1) What methods do present company managements use to assess the managerial abilities and potential of their successors? (2) What qualities do present managers seek in the development and promotion of their successors?"


The objectives, methods, and skills of appraisal interviewing cannot be studied and evaluated separately, since each is related to the other and determines the nature of the other. Three basically different methods of interviewing ("Tell and Sell," "Tell and Listen," and "Problem Solving") are used to study the relationships between these aspects. Each
interviewing method is demonstrated twice so that a total of six unrehearsed role-playing interviews of the same case study are recorded. The discussion of the cause and effect relationships in the case-study material permits a degree of communication that cannot be achieved through a textbook approach using principles and abstractions.


This article argues that the planned performance approach to executive appraisal provides several important advantages over earlier subjective and mathematical approaches. Some of these are: (1) long- and short-term objectives of the enterprise become an integral part of the performance process, (2) job responsibilities of executives provide the basis for setting individual targets, (3) outstanding and poor performances receive primary attention, and (4) the role of personality and mathematics is lessened.


“The purpose of this book is threefold: (1) to stimulate the individual manager; (2) to assist the top manager in the direction of his subordinates; and (3) to amplify and by example illustrate a line-staff relationship that will aid the line organization to do its own managerial job.” The first part of the book presents a philosophy of management development and the line-staff relationship. The second, by showing several examples, sets forth methods of appraising, reviewing, and interviewing management people. Finally, the author outlines practical ways of bringing about development.


Analysis of 75 appraisal interviews conducted by management personnel from industry and government using standard problem and role-playing procedures. While discussing the relative effectiveness of the “tell and sell,” “tell and listen,” and “mutual problem solving” methods, the author points out the reasons why so many appraisal interviews are not successful and the need for interview training.


Traditional rating plans fail because the payoff rules of the organization, which are a logical outgrowth of the organization power structure, encourage failure. Modification of the structure could be attained by setting up a “permanent arrangement for ‘special assignments’ removing the man from the authority of his supervisor and placing him in
care of a top-level committee. This is superior to job-rotation and personal-assistant arrangements which preserve the basic power elements of any one-man appraisal scheme."

2. Company Experience with Various Appraisal Plans


Report on use of systematic executive appraisal by the Atlantic Refining Company through its Management Personnel Inventory and Development Plan. The plan is designed to provide multiple sources of information and impressions concerning an individual's performance and potentiality. These sources include the person being appraised, two higher levels of management, and staff members with whom the person deals.


Report on how 47 companies appraise men of executive caliber, what kind of information is sought, how many items appear on the appraisal forms, how degrees of merit are expressed, and who does the appraising.


Describes an integrated approach to executive appraisals developed at the U.S. Reduction Company. The program consists of five steps: (1) the personnel specialist and supervisor interview the appraisee; (2) the personnel specialist helps the supervisor arrive at a comprehensive and objective appraisal; (3) the appraisal is based on specific action and performance; (4) a development program is set up to help the subordinate improve his performance and to prepare him for greater responsibility; (5) the supervisor is prepared for counseling by a role-playing session.


These papers describe the experiences of the Owens-Illinois Glass Company and the Standard Oil Company (Ohio) with executive appraisal.