Table of Contents

The Imperative or Community Organization .................................................. 1
The Usefulness of a General Concept of the Community............................... 2
General Forms of Organization of the Community in Balochistan............... 3
The Specific Program for Integrating the Community
of users into SAP Programs ......................................................................... 4
The Sustainable Development Policy Institute is an independent, non-profit, non-government policy research institute, meant to provide expert advice to the government (at all levels), political organizations, and the mass media. It is a service agency, providing free advice, and administered by an independent Board of Governors.

Board of Governors:

Mr V. A. Jafarey  
*Chairman of the Board*

Khalid Ahmed  
Editor, AAJ KAL

Syed Babar Ali  
Advisor, Packages Ltd.

Dr Tariq Banuri  
Executive Director, SDPI

Dr Parvez Hassan  
Senior Partner, Hassan & Hassan Advocates

Aban Marker Kabraji  
Country Representative, IUCN-Pakistan

Sohaib Sultan Khan  
Senior Advisor, NRSP

Dr G. M. Khattak  
Co-ordinator, Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy

Abdul Rahim Mahsud  
Regional Representative for West Asia, Nippon Gieken Associates

Dr Atta-ur-Rahman  
Director, HEJ Research Institute, Karachi University

Imtiaz Ahmed Sahibzada  
Secretary, Environment and Urban Affairs Division

Dr Arshad Zaman  
Former Chief Economist to the Government of Pakistan

In the Policy Paper series, the SDPI publishes unsolicited policy advice on practical policy issues in the sphere of development. The papers are written by SDPI's regular or affiliated staff and are meant to provide clear-cut policy outlines which would promote just and sustainable development.
1 The Imperative for Community Organization

The Social Action Plan (SAP) by persistent poor performance in the social sectors has been necessitated to conceptualise, plan, and implement SAP in Balochistan, it is necessary to address three problems, namely, Low level of investment; Inefficient utilization of investment; and inadequate management and maintenance of developed capacity.

The lack of investment in the social sectors is clearly the cause of the deficiency in social services. The additional funding made available through SAP does address this problem, but only in part. The creation of additional capacity in the social sectors, as seen above divides into two financial parts. One part is development expenditure for the new capacity, which is a one off cost, and the second part is maintenance expenditure for this new capacity, which is a recurrent cost. The additional funding made available through SAP meets the development cost, and the recurring cost only for the 3 years over which SAP extends. So one major problem for the province will be the need to find funding for the recurring cost after 3 years. A more long run problem will be to maintain the rate of growth of development expenditure after 3 years, to prevent a deterioration in the per capita gains made during SAP.

Therefore a one off step up in investment in the social sectors for 3 years is not a sufficient condition for long run improvement. What is needed is the ability to generate an increase in investment over a much more sustained period of time.

The second major causal factor is inefficient utilization of investment to create capacity in the social sectors. Low as the investment levels are for the social sectors, even these are not well utilized. As a result, social capacity is significantly lower than that warranted by extant levels of investment. There is in effect a trickle down theory working in social sector investment at present. This implies a very erroneous policy implication for the social sectors, that with a large expenditure in the social sectors, some of it will hopefully trickle down and manifest itself in additional capacity. This policy is clearly not acceptable in a recession ridden world economy, and a budget deficit constrained national economy. Yet if SAP investment is carried out in the same way that it has been done in the past, we can only hope for trickle down, and the crisis will persist.

The third major causal factor contributing to the crisis in the social sectors is a demonstrated inability to maintain established capacity. There are schools without teachers, basic health units without staff and medicines, and population planning units without clients. Since the whole objective of social sector capacity is to deliver social services, service-less capacity cannot really be counted as capacity. And if SAP investment is carried on as past investment has been, then we will simply get more of the same, a high proportion of service-less capacity.

So we have 3 sets of causal factors leading to the present crisis in the social sectors. If SAP investment is made as past investment has been, then we will face three sets of problems. There will be the short run problem of recurring costs after SAP, and the long run problem of maintaining the SAP investment growth rate in capacity than warranted by the investment level. And a high proportion of the established capacity will be service-less.
The considered solution that attacks these 3 causal factors is the organization of the community to participate in these social services.

2 The Usefulness of a General Concept of the Community

Various forms of organization of the community in Pakistan, and in economies similar to ours show that the concept of the community is very useful to tackle the 3 causal factors leading to the crisis in the social sectors.

For our purpose here, the community can be defined as a group of people sharing a specific need. So most of the people of a particular village may share the common problem of access to a health service. This gives a community with respect to health needs. Most of the villagers may share a common problem of access to potable water. This again a community, this time with respect to water supply needs. A particular set of villagers may share a common need of access to girls school. This gives a community within the village with respect to girls schooling needs. Or the village's married women in particular age cohort may have a common need for access to a family planning needs. Similarly for urban areas, specific population groups can be designated as communities with respect to specific needs.

The community so defined can be organized to tackle the 3 causal factors.

The first set of problems raised is that of meeting recurring costs for maintenance in the short run, and increasing the post SAP level of investment in the long run. If we make the reasonable assumption that SAP will terminate at the end of 3 years, that leaves two sources of meeting recurring costs and upping development costs. One source is the government. The second source is the community of users. If the federal and provincial governments were in a position to entirely meet recurring costs, and up future development costs, then we would not have our present problems, we would not need SAP today, and we have defined away the entire problem. The crux of the problem is that the federal and provincial governments will not be able to carry the recurring costs and development costs of the social sector on trend after SAP. This puts at least part of the responsibility of meeting these costs on the community of users. Based upon existing experience, the community can be so organized as to meet some of the recurring expenditure and initiate some investment in capacity in the long run.

The second problem that we are likely to encounter is that investment only trickles down, so that capacity is much lower than that warranted by the investment level. The third problem is that of the creation of service-less capacity. Both these causal factors are themselves rooted in deficiency of accountability of the social sectors. Again, accountability of the social sectors can be increased in two ways. Social sectors can be made more accountable to the government. And social sectors can be made more accountable to the community of users. Since the community of users have the greater incentive to implement accountability, rather than the government, it will be more cost effective to make the social sector accountable to the community.

So the community of users has to play a very necessary role in SAP, in meeting part of it's own costs, and in instituting accountable of capacity development. It is important to recognize that this part transfer of responsibility of social sector development from the government to the community radically changes the motor of growth. If the government is entirely responsible for social sector development, the growth dynamic is moral and ethical, that deprivation of the population should be decreased. If the community of users acquires some responsibility for their own development, then what has changed is not self interest, which continues ceteris paribus. What is introduced is the principle of competition within the community. If diverse communities are empowered to be able to change their own conditions, then there will be
significant competition between them to change. The demonstration effect between communities has been observed to be very powerful in such experiments.

This growth dynamic of competition between communities, will clearly be much stronger than the alternative growth dynamic of the government's ethical motivation. Based on these pragmatic considerations, the SAP program in Balochistan cannot afford to marginalise the community of users, despite onerous conditions in the province.

3 General Forms of Organization of the Community in Balochistan

Conditions for the involvement of the community of users in SAP programs, in Balochistan, are onerous in the short run. Balochistan in comparison to the other provinces, as seen above, is simply less developed. Balochistan's infrastructure is lower than other provinces, and is spread more thinly over the largest geographical area. Manufacturing is the least developed in Balochistan, leaving a much higher proportion of the population dependent on the land. Agriculture in its turn is more constrained than other in other provinces by the lack of water and irrigation. The result is a large rural population, with a low income, low endowments, low physical infrastructure, and the least developed of the social sectors compared to the other provinces. The arid conditions also give a higher nomadic population in Balochistan.

Given these conditions, integration of the community of users into the SAP program will clearly be much more challenging in Balochistan compared to the other provinces. In this section we will outline a general model of social sector development designed for these conditions. This is an important heuristic device for our long term plan for integration of the community of users in social sector development. In the following Section 4 we will specify the precise measures we will undertake for the short run in initiating community integration into the SAP program in Balochistan.

Pragmatism requires that we recognize that there are four distinct agents in social sector development. These are the government, public representatives, and community of users, and Non Government Organizations (NGOs). Given Balochistan's conditions, all four have to play a cooperative game for social sector development.

The government is the most organized, well endowed, and technically skilled amongst the four agents. This gives the government the primary role of funding, and administering projects. The main administering unit can be the suggested District Development Committee (DDC). Government constituents of the DDC can be the Deputy Commissioner (DC), the line department engineers, the line department officers, the Deputy Secretary Finance, and a representative of Planning and Development (P&D).

More effective administering and accountability to the government will require a gradual decentralization of decision making power down to lower levels in the hierarchy. For this, the investment sanctioning ceiling of both the higher level Divisional Committee, and the DDC can be increased over time.

Public representatives can preempt considerable administrative power and financial endowments. Their main role should be to drum up financial support for social sector projects for their constituents. For this, the local Members of the National Assembly (MNA), Members of the Provincial Assembly (MPA), Senators, and Chairman of the Zila Council need to the DDCs. Public representatives do not form a continuous hierarchy, they fall into two distinct levels. The higher level comprises the MNAs, MPAs, Senators, and even members of the Zila council. The lower level comprises the members of the rural Union Council, and the Town and Municipal Committees. These lower level councils, euphemistically called Local Councils (LCS), are clearly more integrated with the community of users rather than the higher level public representatives. Decentralization of
decisions making powers for better accountability also requires that financial allocations be transferred to these LCs. These LCs can be integrated with the sub-divisional offices of the DDCs.

The community of users are the most unorganized, and technically unskilled of the four agents. At the micro level they need to be organized into a board based on demand for a single facility, like a school, a health unit, or a sanitation, population control, or nutrition circle. This board can then advocate the need for the facility, negotiate with the LC cum sub-divisional DDC for the facility, and help execute, and administer the facility. The role of the board can increase in phases, along with it's administering skills. The simplest most unskilled job for the nascent board is monitoring the running and maintenance of the board, in watch dog capacity. From this lowest level of administering a project, the complexity, time allocation, and skill requirement of the job successively increase, to supervising maintenance, running, execution, and eventually design of the project. The board can successively take over these phases of the project, culminating in it's ability to conceptualize it's own needs.

Different boards of a community of users can stack themselves together voluntarily if it helps them to coordinate, and increase their bargaining power vis a vis the DDCs and LCs. Decentralization of decision making will require the transfer of some financial allocation to these boards in graduated phases.

NGOs have three relative advantages vis a vis the other agents. They are good organizers. They embody and impart technical skills. And they can also help drum up financial support. In Balochistan, only NGOs are in a position to organise the community of users into boards based on social needs. Neither the government, nor the public representatives of wither level, nor the community of users themselves are in any position to become the organizers. So this must be their major role. Then they can skill the boards to gradually take over the more complex phased of the project. Finally they can catalyse the community of users to accumulate on their own, and drum up financial support from outside the community.

So the NGOs can work with the boards of the community of users, the sub-divisional DDCs, and the LCs. The NGOs will require some funding from the government for their organizing and skilling functions. Decentralization of decision making power will also require some financial transfers to the NGOs for investment projects.

So this very abstract model of grass roots social development envisages a micro level cooperative game between, a community board for a social facility, an NGO, an LC, and a sub-divisional DDC. If the boards come to stack up vertically, they can deal with the DDCs, and Divisional Committees.

4 The Specific Program for Integrating the Community of Users into SAP Programs

4.1 The Community of users and NGOs in Balochistan - The Stylised Facts

Our model for integrating and community of users into the SAP program argues that the community be phased in gradually. This implies going from simple jobs like monitoring, to successively more complex and skill and time demanding jobs like supervising maintenance, running, execution, and eventually design. At present the community is not organized at all to undertake even the simplest job of monitoring the running and maintenance of a facility, like a school or a basic health unit. Therefore we will have to begin by instituting this first phase.

Our model also argues that the government in Balochistan is in no position to act as an organiser of the community of users. This has to be done by the NGOs whose greater relative advantage lies in this function. The position of NGOs in Balochistan is the following:
(a) There are approximately a dozen reputable NGOs in Balochistan registered with the Welfare department. With the notable exception of one NGO, none of these has an established network beyond the provincial headquarters.

(b) The one notable exception is the Balochistan Rural Support Program (BRSP). BRSP is a private, non-profit company, registered in 1991 under the Companies Act. It is funded by the Governments of Pakistan, and Germany. BRSP’s main inspiration and style of operation is the Agha Khan Rural Support Program (AKRSP) in the Northern Areas. It helps create Village Organizations (VOs) in rural communities. It then cooperates with the VO to set up a demanded project to generate employment and income. In a relatively short period of time, BRSP has begun operating in over 200 villages, spread over 5 districts of Balochistan. BRSP’s budget in its first year of operation is Rs 44 million, Rs 16 million of which came from the Government of Pakistan. Its overhead costs are high at 41%.

(c) The National Rural Support Program (NRSP) has been instituted as an umbrella program for the provincial rural support programs (RSPs), and to take them to scale. The chief executive of the NRSP has asked the Chief Minister of Balochistan for 6 districts to operate in. The Chief Minister has given NRSP the 6 newly created districts in the province. These districts are also amongst the more deficient in the province. However it is estimated that NRSP will take at least 2 to 3 years to establish itself in these districts.

So what emerges from these stylised facts is that for the immediate SAP program of 3 years, only the BRSP is in place to help organise communities of users. Its presence is limited to 200 villages out of an approximate 6000 in Balochistan. So even BRSPs estimated doubling of villages coverage over the next year and half, it will still cover only about 5% of the villages in the province, for the duration of SAP. Finally BRSP has largely operated in the productive sectors so far. The introduction of Social sector programs for them will be a new initiative. In meetings between P&D and BRSP however, BRSP has agreed in principle to cooperate with the SAP program, subject to finalization of the details.

The community of users itself is not yet organized, so its involvement in SAP projects where possible will have to begin from the last and least complex of the project.

4.2 The Role of the Government, Public Representatives, the Community of Users, and NGOs in SAP projects.

SAP projects can be divided into 6 successive phases. These are:
  (i) Identification and Location.
  (ii) Financial Conceptualization and Technical Design.
  (iii) Execution
  (iv) Running.
  (v) Maintenance.
  (vi) Monitoring and Evaluation.

The following roles are planned for the 4 agents in these 6 phases.

(i) Identification and Location

The identification and location of SAP projects will be largely through a combination of the government and public representatives in the first year of SAP. The Balochistan government’s machinery for SAP consists of the following hierarchy. There is a SAP coordination committee, followed by the P&D Board, followed by Divisional Development Committee, followed by the DDCs. The Divisional Committee and the DDCs in consultation with the local MNAs and MPAs identify the project in education, health, and rural water supply. The Chief Minister gives the final approval for the project.
In the subsequent years of SAP, where BRSP exists, it can help organise the community of users into boards based on demand for a specific facility. The organization of these boards will result in the identification of a specific project. These boards can then negotiate with the DDCs and Public representatives to establish the project. If BRSP has been given some financial allocation for the project, then the boards can negotiate with BRSP to establish the project.

(ii) Financial Conceptualization and Technical Design

At present the financial conceptualization of the SAP projects by the DDC is a simple one. The DDC provide the entire cost of the community of users, this conceptualization will change. The board will be encouraged to accumulate some counterpart funding to the DDC's or BRSP's grant. As the practice develops, the grant can even be converted into a part loan, paid for the board in the long run. The spreading of this principle of the community boards accumulating part funding for the project should help in the long run to maintain the post SAP investment in the social sectors.

Supervision of the technical design of the project is highly skilled job, and the DDCs will carry this out in the first year of SAP. In the following years, BRSP's skills can be used to supplement the DDC's skills where applicable. The community boards will not be ready to take on this skilled job within the SAP years, but possibly later on.

(iii) Execution

The execution of the project is a highly skilled job. It requires a high level of capital equipment, and a large administrative apparatus. Only the government meets these requirements for the immediate 3 years of SAP. So the Engineering line departments will execute the project. Education projects will be executed by the Civil Works Directorate. Water supply projects will be executed by the Communication and Works Department. And health projects will be executed by the Public Health Engineering Department.

However, the job of monitoring and evaluating a project begins with this stage of execution. So, from the following year of SAP, as BRSP manages to organise boards of community users for a facility, these boards can begin to job of monitoring the execution of the facility. In fact the community boards will be in the best position to monitor the execution of the project. If the funding is in the hands of the DDCs, the boards can report their findings to the DDCs. If the funding is in the hands of BRSP, then the boards can even control payments to contractors till they are satisfied. This will bring in the principle of accountability right from the inception of the project, attacking the critical problems of trickle down, and service less capacity.

(iv) Running

Projects are run by professionals, technocrats, and managers. SAP (next page of the draft for typing is missing) easiest. So if financial allocations are to be handed over to a board, they will begin with this function.

Community accumulation for maintenance of a facility is also the easiest step to take in long run community accumulation. Therefore it can be the initiating step in the community board's accumulation process.

(vi) Monitoring and Evaluation

The government has an elaborate apparatus for monitoring and evaluation. There is a Chief Minister's Inspection team. P&D has a Monitoring and Evaluation Cell. This cell has division level directors with investigating facilities. SAP projects will also be monitored using this apparatus. However, where boards of the community of users become organized, they will be encouraged to
take on the job of monitoring and evaluation of the execution, running, and maintenance of projects. This will be very cost effective.

4.3 **Decentralization**

Decentralization of decision making powers can move in three directions as illustrated by the specific measures outlined above. Decision making power can be moved down the ladders of the government, of the public representatives, and of the community. The creation of the DDCs, empowering them, and transferring financial allocations to them, will decentralise government. At a more specific level, within education, the Directorate of Primary schools will be separated from the Directorate of High Schools. Administrative decentralization also requires institutional strengthening to be able to handle the grater work load, and the higher skills required. For this additional staff will be given to the line departments.

The power of public representatives is difficult to decentralise by administrative fiat. However, the lower level LCs will be given a greater administrative role in SAP projects, and their financial allocation ceiling will be raised.

The community of users can also be similarly empowered. As community boards formed, they can be given more administrative powers over projects, beginning with monitoring and evaluation of the execution, running, and maintenance of projects. Some limited financial allocations can also be transferred to the village level boards.

Decentralization will also require the transfer of some financial allocation from the government, to NGOs like BRSP, and in the long run, NRSP.